

**City of Phoenix
General Obligation Bond Committee
Public Safety Subcommittee
Summary Minutes
Monday, September 19, 2022**

City Council Chambers
200 W. Jefferson St.
Phoenix, Ariz.

Subcommittee Members Present

Mr. Steve Beuerlein, Chair
Mr. Rick DeGraw
Ms. Anne Ender, Vice Chair
Mr. Greg Jackson
Ms. Gail Knight
Hon. Daniel Valenzuela
Mr. Alton Washington
Hon. Thelda Williams

Subcommittee Members Absent

Mr. Derrick Hall

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Steve Beuerlein called the Public Safety Subcommittee to order at 9:01 a.m. with Committee members Rick DeGraw, Anne Ender, Greg Jackson, Gail Knight, Alton Washington, and Thelda Williams present. Committee member Daniel Valenzuela joined the meeting at 9:07 a.m.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE (MONTH) (DAY), (YEAR) MEETING MINUTES

Committee member DeGraw made a motion to approve the minutes of the August 29, 2022 Public Safety Subcommittee meeting. Committee member Jackson seconded the motion, which passed unanimously, 7-0. Committee member Valenzuela was not present for the motion.

3. INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

Chair Beuerlein remarked that the committee would begin discussion on prioritizing projects and review results of the survey from the last meeting. He stated that survey results did not represent the committee's final recommendation, and members should advocate for projects they believed were essential. He reminded members there was one final meeting to complete their recommendation.

4. CAPITAL NEEDS AND PRIORITIZATION AND EVALUATION PROCESS

Chair Beuerlein opened the floor to staff to review results of the survey and discuss subcommittee recommendations.

Assistant City Manager Lori Bays introduced Budget and Research Director Chris Fazio, Assistant Police Chief Mike Kurtenbach, and Executive Assistant Fire Chief Scott Walker.

Ms. Bays presented on the responsibility of the subcommittee, an overview of the GO Bond Program, and next steps.

Mr. Fazio discussed the ranking process and survey results.

Vice Chair Ender had a comment, which Chair Beuerlein requested wait until public comment was completed.

Chair Beuerlein opened the floor for public comment.

Assistant City Attorney Julie Kreigh explained the rules for public comment.

Darrell Kriplean spoke in favor of advancing all police projects.

Ben Leuschner expressed support for funding police infrastructure, such as a new Cactus Park Precinct & Northern Command Center. He also spoke in favor of the new Fire Station 70 planned at the current Cactus Park Precinct.

Tim Knobbe spoke in favor of prioritizing all eight fire stations.

Benjamin Lozano Sr. spoke in favor of advancing police projects in the Sunnyslope area.

Chair Beuerlein closed the public comment period.

Chair Beuerlein mentioned that committee members Washington, Valenzuela, Knight, and Williams were present through virtual means.

Vice Chair Ender expressed concern with the decline in police projects' ranking order. She asked how the Maryvale Precinct project could be moved up in the ranking to address critical safety needs.

Mr. Fazio mentioned that staff was tracking motions as deliberations proceeded and that a motion to adjust the ranking would be allowable. Mr. Fazio asked if she felt the current Maryvale Precinct project would address those concerns or if a smaller scope item was needed.

Ms. Bays stated that the concern related to air conditioning unit replacements at Maryvale Precinct that were currently being deferred but could be conducted as an independent project.

Committee member DeGraw made a motion to recommend the first ten ranked projects to the Executive Committee, along with their corresponding project costs, to address increased response times. He asked for the current \$500 million bond amount to be increased to accommodate all ten projects.

Committee member Williams seconded the motion.

Mr. Fazio clarified if the motion was to move the current top ten items forward or if the committee also wished to deliberate on priority order.

Committee member DeGraw motioned for the top ten items to be moved forward and a discussion could follow regarding prioritization.

Mr. Fazio explained that once projects advanced to the Executive Committee and funding levels were determined for each subcommittee, project ranking would be important.

Committee member DeGraw stated he did not have adequate information to rank projects. He indicated that prioritizing the top ten projects would assist with response times and citizen safety. He noted the subcommittee could discuss ranking but was unsure how those decisions would be made.

Chair Beuerlein clarified the motion would be to put forward items one through ten. He also stated the project rankings should come from within the Police and Fire Departments.

Committee member DeGraw stated his trust in Police and Fire staff to make the best decisions on ranking.

Chair Beuerlein asked if Mr. Fazio understood the subcommittee's direction.

Mr. Fazio stated he understood.

Chair Beuerlein clarified that a motion had been made by committee member DeGraw and seconded by committee member Williams to move projects one through ten forward in existing order.

Ms. Bays reminded the subcommittee that bond funds did not cover operating and maintenance costs, which would need to be found in the City budget. She further mentioned that another bond program was expected within the next five to seven years, and it would be essential to have projects completed by then.

Committee member DeGraw expressed uncertainty on whether another bond program would be ready in the next five years and suggested delaying any of the recommended projects further would be unacceptable.

Vice Chair Ender stated Fire and Police response times were not impacted by the same needs. She asked Chief Kurtenbach if the increase in police response times was due to staffing shortages.

Chief Kurtenbach confirmed that Police staffing shortages were directly affecting response times.

Vice Chair Ender explained that Fire response times were caused by lack of equipment or inadequate facilities to house equipment, as opposed to capital needs in Police, which could help recruitment efforts.

Committee member DeGraw stated that he would like to fund all prioritized and future capital needs but indicated it was not realistic. He hoped the first ten projects would alleviate some struggles while reaching a compromise.

Committee member Jackson suggested moving forward with the first ten projects and increasing the total bond amount of \$500 million, which would provide suitable support for Police and Fire.

Committee member Williams expressed support for the Cactus Park Precinct project and noted the Taiwanese Semiconductor Manufacturing Company (TSMC) would increase service demand in the area. She stated that funding the first ten projects would alleviate lack of space around the area and mitigate safety concerns.

Chair Beuerlein asked if Committee member Washington had any comments.

Committee member Washington expressed support for advancing the first ten ranked projects but wanted to ensure Cactus Park Precinct and the fire stations would be staffed properly. He asked staff to review whether the federal infrastructure bill and Inflation Reduction Act could provide additional capital funding to any of the subcommittees, in order to increase bond program capacity for public safety projects.

Ms. Bays answered that \$5 million in federal funding was a possibility for Fire Station 51 but was already included in the cost estimate, so no additional savings would be realized.

Committee member Knight supported the recommendation and pointed out the communities those projects included were densely populated and had been under-represented in public services.

Committee member DeGraw stated the density in those areas had increased dramatically in the last ten years, and that the City needed to respond by providing added Police and Fire support.

Committee member Valenzuela supported Committee member DeGraw's motion and stated that funding the ten projects conveyed that safety was paramount for the community and for Police and Fire personnel.

Vice Chair Ender asked staff if it was possible to increase the bond amount.

Ms. Bays responded that the bond amount was set at \$500 million to maintain the tax rate and that Council would need to decide if a tax increase should be considered.

Vice Chair Ender stated she would not vote in favor of the motion, because the remaining police projects were just as critical and should also move forward.

Committee member DeGraw stated raising taxes should be considered by City Council and believed the public would support an increase if it pertained to public safety.

Chair Beuerlein expressed support for Police and Fire. He noted that the recommendation posed challenges to staff but believed it would do what was best for the community and public safety personnel. He asked Mr. Fazio to repeat the motion and to call the roll.

Mr. Fazio clarified the motion as recommending to the Executive Committee projects one through ten and their bond funding amounts in the order presented, as noted below.

1. Fire Station 7 / Community Assistance Program (7th Avenue & Hatcher Road), \$21.4 million
2. Fire Station 13 / Community Assistance Program (44th Street & Thomas Road), \$21.7 million
3. Fire Station 15 / Community Assistance Program (45th Avenue & Camelback Road), \$21.4 million
4. Cactus Park Precinct & Northern Command Center Relocation, \$49.5 million
5. Fire Station 51 (51st Avenue & SR 303), \$18.5 million
6. Police Property Management Warehouse Renovation, \$9.0 million
7. Fire Station 70 / Community Assistance Program (39th Avenue & Cactus Road), \$17.9 million
8. Maryvale Police Precinct Renovations, \$3.0 million
9. Fire Station 74 (19th Avenue & Chandler Boulevard), \$10.3 million
10. Fire Station 20 (7th Avenue & Glendale Road), \$18.2 million

The motion passed by a 7-1 vote, with Chair Beuerlein and Committee members DeGraw, Jackson, Knight, Valenzuela, Washington, and Williams voting yes, and Vice Chair Ender voting no.

Chair Beuerlein asked if anyone had additional comments.

Committee member DeGraw asked if subcommittee members could address the Executive Committee when it meets.

Ms. Bays answered that Chair Beuerlein would represent the subcommittee and present its recommendation to the Executive Committee but deferred to Ms. Kreigh to answer if subcommittee members may attend and provide public comment.

Ms. Kreigh explained that committee member DeGraw could attend and provide comments.

Chair Beuerlein reminded members and the audience that the next and final meeting was scheduled for October 3, 2022.

Mr. Fazio stated that meeting was optional since a recommendation had been made to the Executive Committee.

Chair Beuerlein confirmed that the subcommittee's work was complete. He thanked Chief Walker and Chief Kurtenbach and their staff for their support. He asked for a motion to adjourn.

Ms. Bays thanked the committee members for their service.

5. ADJOURNMENT

Committee member DeGraw made a motion to adjourn. Vice Chair Ender seconded the motion, which passed unanimously, 8-0.

The meeting adjourned at 10:01 a.m.