

**City of Phoenix
General Obligation Bond Executive Committee
Summary Minutes
Monday, October 24, 2022**

City Council Chambers
200 W. Jefferson St.
Phoenix, Ariz.

Committee Members Present

Ms. Sharon Harper, Chair
Dr. LeeAnn Aguilar-Lawlor, Vice Chair
Ms. Jennifer Grandahl
Ms. Pam Kehaly
Mr. Rick Naimark
Ms. Anne Ender
Ms. Diana Yazzie Devine
Mr. Abraham James
Mr. David Martin
Ms. Devney Preuss
Mr. Robin Reed*
Ms. Ginger Torres
Hon. Mary Rose Wilcox

Committee Members Absent

Ms. Dana Kennedy
Mr. Ron Butler

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Harper called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. with Vice Chair Aguilar-Lawlor and committee members Jennifer Grandahl, Pam Kehaly, Rick Naimark, Anne Ender, Diana Yazzie Devine, Abraham James, David Martin, Devney Preuss, Ginger Torres, and Mary Rose Wilcox present.

1. Minutes of the General Obligation Bond Executive Committee

Committee member Martin made a motion to approve the minutes of the October 17, 2022 General Obligation Bond Executive Committee meeting. Committee member Devine seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 12-0.

2. Introductory Remarks

Chair Harper reiterated the charge of the Executive Committee to identify urgent capital needs throughout the City for the \$500 million GO Bond program and indicated there would be no flexibility on the program total.

Chair Harper shared there had been more than 800 comments from residents through various channels and explained ongoing opportunities for public comment.

Chair Harper stated she wanted to determine the total population of projects to be evaluated and would ask committee members to identify projects they wanted considered that had not been included in subcommittee recommendations.

3. Subcommittee Reports and General Obligation Bond Program Discussion

Chair Harper introduced Parks and Recreation Subcommittee Chair Mary Rose Wilcox to present on the subcommittee's recommended project ranking.

Member Wilcox began by thanking staff for their assistance and expressing gratitude for her appointment as chair. She detailed the subcommittee's \$109.7 million recommendation, which included four projects that were not originally prioritized and five projects that were reduced in scope. She stated the subcommittee prioritized equitable distribution of projects throughout the city and stated projects ranked one through 14 were highly recommended and 15 onward were lower priority.

Member Wilcox highlighted important considerations from the subcommittee, including the addition of Citywide Funding for Parks Minor Capital Projects to address smaller capital needs for parks, upgraded park facilities, and equitable distribution of funding for parks such as Desert View Civic Space and Estrella Civic Space.

Member Wilcox introduced Parks and Recreation Director Cynthia Aguilar to present on the projects recommended by the Parks & Recreation subcommittee, including their rank order, recommended funding levels, and project scopes.

*Committee member Robin Reed joined the meeting at 9:14 a.m.

Member Kehaly asked for more information on the geographic distribution of projects, noting that many of the Parks and Recreation projects were in Districts 7 and 8.

Ms. Aguilar spoke of the importance of having a well-balanced package and explained projects located in those districts were older facilities with greater infrastructure needs. She stated the subcommittee had discussed concerns about the equitable distribution of projects throughout the City, which influenced the final ranking of Desert View Civic Space and additions of Sweetwater Park Improvements and Citywide Funding for Parks Minor Capital Projects.

Member Wilcox added that the subcommittee tried to add North Phoenix projects and the Estrella Civic Space was in the far West Valley. She also described Hance Park as a citywide attraction, despite being in District 7.

Member Naimark asked why there was a net increase in operating costs for projects involving swimming pool conversions.

Ms. Aguilar explained regional pools were planned for Harmon and Maryvale Parks resulting in year-round programming and requiring greater staffing levels.

Member Naimark wanted clarification that the operating costs presented were net figures above existing operating costs.

Ms. Aguilar confirmed that was correct.

Chair Harper introduced Environment & Sustainability Subcommittee Chair Ginger Torres to present on the subcommittee's recommendation.

Member Torres began by thanking staff and the subcommittee, as well as members of the public for shaping the recommendations. She stressed the importance of the \$25.1 million recommendation in addressing environmental challenges threatening residents' public health and the City's economic vitality, allowing the City flexibility to achieve its climate and environmental leadership goals, and reducing operating expenses.

Deputy City Manager Karen Peters echoed staff's appreciation of the subcommittee who provided thoughtful and thorough consideration. She introduced Public Works Director Joe Giudice to assist with the presentation, and Heat Response and Mitigation Director David Hondula, Environmental Programs Coordinator Rosanne Albright, and Chief Sustainability Officer Mark Hartman to address questions from the committee.

Ms. Peters and Mr. Giudice presented the ranked list of projects recommended by the Environment & Sustainability Subcommittee, including the project scopes and funding levels.

Member Ender asked about tree maintenance equity and wanted to know how the City would take care of existing trees, such as those in North Central Phoenix along Murphy Bridle Path.

Ms. Peters explained maintenance of the existing tree canopy was the responsibility of the Parks and Recreation and Street Transportation Departments.

Dr. Hondula agreed maintenance is critical and explained there would be clearer guidance to inform the Heat Resiliency GO Bond project once the Tree and Shade Master Plan was revised.

Member Martin noticed the Children's Museum of Phoenix Expansion Project included solar installation and asked if that was separate from Energy and Water Efficiency and Renewable Energy Upgrades at City Facilities.

Mr. Giudice clarified that the graphic displayed an existing solar installation at that facility, not a proposed installation.

Member Naimark asked if property owners were also responsible for maintenance of trees in the right of way.

Dr. Hondula confirmed that was correct and acknowledged the complicated web of tree maintenance agreements. He explained there may be some minor operating costs but staff would work to minimize them.

Member Torres clarified that the subcommittee considered trees as critical infrastructure and their recommendation was to ensure trees were planted in the most vulnerable areas of the community first. She stressed the importance of the history behind the City's tree canopy and the practices of the Indigenous peoples who were caretakers of the land.

Chair Harper introduced Arts & Culture Subcommittee Chair Devney Preuss, who discussed the \$64 million recommendation and the extensive public comments the subcommittee considered.

Member Preuss introduced Arts & Culture Director Mitch Menchaca, who presented on the Arts & Culture subcommittee recommended projects. Mr. Menchaca introduced Phoenix Convention Center Deputy Director April Truncellito to answer questions about the Herberger Theater Center Improvements project.

Member Preuss discussed how the involvement of non-profit organizations operating city facilities made the subcommittee unique. She discussed the reason behind the total funding amount requested and thanked members of the subcommittee and staff for their involvement.

Member Reed asked if there was sufficient access for Phoenix Theatre patrons who have mobility issues.

Mr. Menchaca stated the front of house was completely ADA accessible because of Phoenix Theatre's fundraising efforts. He noted the GO Bond project intended to make back of house compliant.

Member Wilcox asked if the project would be a renovation of the second floor or a complete rebuild.

Mr. Menchaca stated it would be an addition to the existing structure.

Member Wilcox asked if it will be on the north side of the building.

Mr. Menchaca stated the addition would be built on the northeast side of the building.

Vice Chair Aguilar-Lawlor asked if the Phoenix Theatre Company ADA Accessibility Project was the same as the ADA Improvement project presented by the Neighborhoods & City Services Subcommittee during the last meeting.

Mr. Menchaca stated the subcommittee recommended the project separately from the ADA Improvements considered by the Neighborhoods & City Services Subcommittee but confirmed it had been discussed.

Member Naimark asked how the Phoenix Theatre Company ADA Accessibility project relates to the facility's existing expansion plans. He also declared a potential conflict with the Valley Youth Theatre Permanent Home Project, due to his employment at Arizona State University (ASU).

Mr. Menchaca replied staff could provide information on the Phoenix Theatre expansion to the subcommittee and acknowledged the presence of Phoenix Theatre representatives at the meeting, who could address this question in public comment.

Chair Harper introduced Economic Development & Education Subcommittee Chair Robin Reed, who reiterated the committee's goals to drive continued growth in Phoenix and improve quality of jobs and redevelopment. He emphasized the importance of continuing to give Phoenix a seat at the table to help revitalize the community.

Member Reed introduced Deputy City Manager Ginger Spencer to present on the subcommittee's recommendations.

Ms. Spencer began by recognizing the leadership and service of the subcommittee support from City staff through the subcommittee meetings. She introduced Community and Economic Development Director Christine Mackay, who presented the Economic Development & Education Subcommittee recommended projects.

Member Reed discussed the approach taken by the subcommittee to rank its projects and the funding targets and presented an updated recommendation that would meet the City Manager's recommended targets.

Member Preuss expressed appreciation for Percent for Art through the proposed projects and the support for small businesses through the Economic Development Public Infrastructure. She asked for clarification that this project was recommended to not move forward if the Executive Committee adopted the City Manager's recommended targets.

Member Reed confirmed that was correct.

Member Kehaly reiterated her concerns about the geographic distribution of GO Bond project investment and requested staff produce a map showing what would be spent throughout the City.

Budget and Research Director Amber Williamson confirmed staff could provide that information.

Member Naimark declared a conflict on the ASU Health Technology Center due to his employment with ASU. He asked why the airport could not acquire the land for the Spark Land Acquisition.

Ms. Mackay stated there was no longer funding available in the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) program to acquire the land sites.

Member Devine expressed her support for a citywide distribution of projects but noted that certain areas of the City lacked investment, so it was appropriate to see a concentration of projects in those places.

Member Wilcox expressed support for public infrastructure and noted that inner-city projects were cost-prohibitive.

Member Ender agreed with Ms. Kehaly and asked if the disparity was a function of City Council.

City Manager Jeff Barton stated there was some aspect of political decision, but the greater issue was how the city had grown. He explained there were areas where the City was still playing catch-up and had not been provided the same level of amenities that others had received over time.

Ms. Mackay added, in response to Member Naimark's previous question, that the FAA did not allow airport funds to be spent on land acquisition.

Chair Harper thanked staff and subcommittee chairs for their presentations and opened the floor for public comment.

Paul Hommert spoke in support of reinstating the \$10 million funding level for Cultural Facilities Critical Equipment Replacements funding to support critical maintenance needs at Ballet Arizona.

Kristine Morris spoke in support of the Estrella Civic Space.

Dan Penton spoke in support of \$4.9 million for the Laveen Area Conveyance Channel.

Joseph Specter spoke in support of funding for improvements and renovations to Arts and Culture venues.

Tyler Service spoke in support of the Valley Youth Theatre Permanent Home Project.

Pete Lumianski spoke in support of funding for a Cold War Monument at Steele Indian School Park. Mr. Lumianski requested a response from the committee on the viability of their project.

Nima Sadeghian spoke in support of funding for the Garment League.

Steven Bruckal spoke in support of Margaret T Hance Park Improvements.

Caroline Van Slyke spoke in support of Margaret T Hance Park Improvements.

Mike Bolar spoke in support of \$10 million for Cultural Facilities Critical Equipment Replacements to address deferred maintenance at Ballet Arizona.

Renee Hardaway spoke in support of funding for the Garment League.

Marvene Lobato spoke in support of the Estrella Civic Space.

Francisca Montoya spoke in support of the Estrella Civic Space.

Jami Kozemczak spoke in support of Cultural Facilities Critical Equipment Replacements to address deferred maintenance and Symphony Hall Theatrical Venue Improvements.

Steve Oberhansly spoke in support of reinstating the \$10 million funding level for Cultural Facilities Critical Equipment Replacements to address critical maintenance needs at Phoenix Art Museum.

Tim Madrid spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space.

Freddie Villalon spoke in support of the Estrella Civic Space.

Alexandra Papazian spoke in support of reinstating the \$10 million funding level for Cultural Facilities Critical Equipment Replacements to address critical maintenance needs at Ballet Arizona.

Tricee Thomas spoke in support of funding to support construction of a new facility for the Garment League.

Markus Cenicerros spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space.

Taylor Earl spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space and advocated for responsible development.

Karina Dominguez spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space and the Maryvale Regional Pool and Two Splash Pad Sites.

Xenia Orona spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space and advocated for additional amenities and resources to improve health and quality of life. She also advocated for the creation of a 50-year retrospective map linked to ethnic distribution if the committee-proposed map of project distribution by district were to be produced.

Emilio Gaynor spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space and more public spaces in the area.

*Ms. Ender left the meeting at 10:54 a.m.

Catrina Kahler spoke in support of Margaret T Hance Park Improvements and all Arts & Culture recommended projects.

Cyndy Gaughan spoke in support of the ASU Health Technology Center, all Arts & Culture recommended projects, and Margaret T Hance Park Improvements.

Jillian Donegan spoke in support of funding for the Garment League and advocated for the City to highlight the significance of fashion's economic impact and support for other industries.

Larry Lazarus spoke in support of Margaret T Hance Park Improvements.

Laura Earl spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space.

Oscar De las Salas spoke in support of all recommended Arts and Culture projects, as well as the Margaret T Hance Park Improvements and Estrella Civic Space.

Mark Mettes spoke in support of all Arts and Culture projects, including Herberger Theater Center Theatrical Improvements.

Lisa Perez spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space and noted the importance of GO Bond funding as the Estrella Civic Space does not have a conservancy or additional fundraising mechanism.

Shawn King spoke in support of Symphony Hall Theatrical Venue Improvements.

Hope Ozer spoke in support of the Valley Youth Theatre Permanent Home Project.

Masavi Perea acknowledged committee comments on historic disinvestment in Districts 7 and 8, spoke in support of Estrella Civic Space and Heat Resiliency, and thanked Environment & Sustainability Chair Ginger Torres for her acknowledgement of the Indigenous land.

Sally Morton spoke in support of the ASU Health Technology Center, highlighting its economic benefits and the longtime partnership between ASU and the City.

Vania Guevara spoke in support of the recommendations from Environment & Sustainability Subcommittee, primarily Heat Resiliency and tree shade planting. She also spoke in support of the Estrella Civic Space.

Bobb Cooper spoke in support of the Valley Youth Theatre Permanent Home Project.

Channel Powe advocated for increased funding for South Mountain Community Center Renovations and South Mountain Youth Center Improvements. She expressed a desire for passionate community members to be included in future committees and the process.

Matthew Schaefer spoke in support of Phoenix Theatre ADA Accessibility and highlighted the importance of creating a space for artists with mobility issues.

Kate Wells spoke in support of Children's Museum of Phoenix Expansion, referencing supplemental materials provided to the subcommittee detailing the scope of the project.

Ruben Alonzo spoke in support of the ASU Health Technology Center.

Michael Barnard spoke in support of Phoenix Theatre ADA Accessibility.

Chris Yoo spoke in support of the ASU Health Technology Center.

Betsy Ferman spoke in support of Children's Museum of Phoenix Expansion.

Marian Tadano Shee spoke about her personal experience and advocated for funding for the Arizona Jewish Historical Society Renovation & Expansion Project.

Grace O'Sullivan spoke in support of the ASU Health Technology Center.

Werner Salinger spoke in support of funding for the Arizona Jewish Historical Society Renovation & Expansion Project.

Rafael Fonseca spoke in support of the ASU Health Technology Center.

Rabbi Jeffrey Schesnol spoke in support of funding for the Arizona Jewish Historical Society Renovation & Expansion Project, stressing its historical significance and the importance of the center for all people.

Sandra Bassett spoke in support of funding for Phoenix Center for the Arts Theater Improvements and expressed gratitude to the Arts and Culture Subcommittee and Parks and Recreation Department.

Sean Berens advocated for additional funding for affordable housing and supported Housing, Human Services, and Homelessness Subcommittee recommendations.

Jennifer Longdon spoke in support of Phoenix Theatre Company ADA Accessibility, further advocated for opportunities for creators with disabilities, and stated the GO Bond process was not inclusive because the voices of disability communities have not been represented on the committee.

Leah Fregulia spoke in support of Margaret T Hance Park Improvements.

Chair Harper thanked those who provided public comment and stated deliberations would begin at the next meeting. She asked the committee if there were more projects they wanted to add to the full population of projects.

Member Naimark asked for clarification that the South Phoenix Community Center and South Phoenix Youth Center were included in the Parks and Recreation recommendation.

Ms. Aguilar confirmed both projects were included.

Vice Chair Aguilar-Lawlor requested more information on the Cold War Memorial at Steele Indian School Park.

Ms. Aguilar stated the project was presented to the Parks and Recreation Subcommittee, but it was not included in their final recommendation.

Member Preuss stated the Garment League project came late in the process and asked staff to provide additional information on it.

Mr. Menchaca stated the Garment League shared their proposal at the fourth Arts and Culture subcommittee meeting and the subcommittee did not have clarifying questions.

Member Wilcox asked staff to provide more information on whether recommended funding levels for projects could be further reduced by substituting or applying for other funding.

Member Martin noted there had been public comments about public-private partnership funding and asked for that to be illustrated.

Member Naimark added there were impact fees and sales tax dollars and requested a general overview of those funds to have a more complete picture of how other projects are funded.

Member Wilcox wanted to know how realistic it would be for projects to be completed or substantially started in five years, especially larger projects.

4. Future Agenda Items

Chair Harper asked staff to look at these suggestions from the committee and evaluate them for the next meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Harper adjourned the meeting at 11:56 a.m.